Reviewer’s report

Title: Foreign bodies in the aerodigestive tract as seen at Bugando Medical Centre, Mwanza, Tanzania: A prospective review of 98 patients

Version: 1 Date: 22 November 2010

Reviewer: Dov Weissberg

Reviewer’s report:

1. Foreign bodies (FBs) in the esophagus and FBs in the tracheobronchial tree present two totally different problems. They should be separated and addressed in two separate papers, not in one. The fact that some authors committed the same mistake and mixed the two subjects, does not make it better. I suggest that the authors write two separate papers, not one.

2. The problem of language:

On page 2, paragraph second from bottom, there is sentence beginning with words The accurate diagnosis...This sentence is composed of 54 words. It is difficult to follow and to understand. It should be divided into 3 short sentences - clear and easy to understand.

Exactly the same applies to page 3, second paragraph, sentence beginning with the words Foreign bodies remaining ...It is composed of 64 words - enough for 4 clear and short sentences.

3. The use of slang. For example, the patient walks in should be replaced with the patient presents. Slang should be avoided.

4. The section Background is by far too long. Much of what is written there is repeated later in the manuscript. Most of it belongs anyway in Discussion. It should be abbreviated to a short Introduction.

5. The authors mentioned an important point: for extraction of FBs, both in the respiratory tree and from the esophagus, one should use a rigid instrument, not flexible. This point should be stressed, and elaborated in the Discussion.

6. Illustrations nos. 2 and 3 do not contribute anything and should be deleted.