Reviewer’s report

Title: Melasma and its association with different types of nevi in women: A case control study

Version: 3 Date: 19 February 2008

Reviewer: Mauro Picardo

Reviewer’s report:

The authors in a case control study on 240 subjects correlate the presence of different type of nevi with the occurrence of melasma. The idea is interesting with the aim of developing specific educational programme, however the study presents some problems:

1. different types of pigmented lesions have been correlated with the presence of melasma, which include nevi and even lentigines and freckle, which could be different pathogenesis
2. the phototype of the individuals in case and control group should be reported
3. since some of the pigmented lesions evaluated as well as melasma could be dependent on the sun exposure abitudes, these should be reported
4. the localization of the pigmented lesions should be described to have the distribution in sun exposed or non-exposed site
5. the number of nevi in the control population seem to be low as compared with previous published data
6. few explanations and/or hypothesis on the described association are reported in the discussion

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.