Reviewer’s report

Title: Case Report: Giant Perineal Keloids.

Version: 2 Date: 7 June 2005

Reviewer: ardeshir bayat

Reviewer’s report:

Thank you for asking me to review this interesting sounding case report. I must say that I was enticed by a promising sounding title and was keen to read on to discover an unusual case of keloid or a new successful variation of therapy for keloids. This paper describes presentation of a large keloid in the perineal region of a patient with family history of keloid scarring who has undergone surgical excision with adjuvant radiotherapy who was only followed up for six months.

The report of large or giant keloids from any part of the human skin is not new and several reports have already alluded to this in the literature. The added importance of family history and its effect on disease phenotype again is not a new finding. However, an unusual clinical presentation or histology aiding management not reported before, may have added value to report of this large lesion in a relatively rarely affected anatomical site. Perhaps the authors may have overlooked this issue and may want to further elaborate on this before a decision on this particular aspect is made.

As regards to treatment, use of radiotherapy in conjunction with surgical excision as evaluated by the authors is not a new concept. The post operative image does not show total eradication of disease as residual keloid still seems to be present. Nevertheless a variation on the existing methods of radiotherapy with definitive long term success (total eradication with a minimum of 1-2 year absence of recurrence or extension of lesion) would be of interest to those involved in management of this disbling and recalcitrant disorder.

This manuscript in its present format does not report anything new that has not been previously stated by other authors, nonetheless I would be delighted to review a resubmission if the above points have been sufficiently addressed and a new revised submission has been forwarded for review. I wish the authors continuing success with their work on treatment of this difficult disorder.

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'