Reviewer's report

Title: Computer-aided dermoscopy for diagnosis of malignant melanoma

Version: 1 Date: 12 March 2005

Reviewer: giuseppe argenziano

Reviewer's report:

General
This is a concise and well written study focusing on the application of a computer system for automated diagnosis of melanoma. The basic value of this paper is represented by the application of an already established computer-aided dermoscopy system on a different population than that already tested using the same system.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)
The main criticism concerns the discussion that is too short and should be improved by the authors, especially in the context of possible limitations of this technique that, in my view, could be too less effective in terms of cost/benefit ratio in a population where the prevalence of melanoma is very low.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)
In the abstract the authors should add the number of melanomas included in this study as diagnosed histopathologically

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)
None

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests'
giuseppe argenziano, md