Reviewer’s report

Title: A liver fibrosis cocktail? Psoriasis, methotrexate and genetic hemochromatosis.

Version: 1 Date: 13 August 2005

Reviewer: Hugh Zachariae

Reviewer’s report:

General
This article contains new and valuable information. Almost all comments belong to the group of minor essential revisions. However, although the alteration of the title is a small problem, it is placed under the heading of "major compulsory revision"

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

1) It is questionable that the title can include the sentence "A liver fibrosis cocktail", when the conclusion of the authors is "significant liver fibrosis was not identified in either patient".
2) It should be noted that all case reports should be accompanied by written and signed consent to publish the information from the patients.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

3) The abstract should mention, that patient B in reality had an additional risk factor as well, the alcohol consumption.
4) The authors recommend the risk of fibrosis be monitored, preferably by non-invasive techniques. This i.e. PIIINP seems not to have been tried. A comment on this would be nice.
5) The introduction as a whole is rather long in relation to the relevant message of the article, and could very well have been shortened.
6) It is recommended, that ultrasound liver examination including reference 24 be omitted, as it is controversial that ultrasound is useful for this matter (i.e."psoriasis and the liver" in Psoriasis eds. Roenigk & Maibach, Marcel Dekker, 1991). "Recent guidelines" relating to reference 23, should be "Recent guidelines from the British Society of Gastroenterology".
7) A figure of histology using a collagen stain showing "the equivocal alchol-associated perivenular fibrosis" in patient B would be in its place and a good supplement to the present figures.
Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

**What next?:** Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests'

Hugh Zachariae, MD, MDSci.