Reviewer's report

Title: Risk of prostate cancer after isolated high-grade prostatic intraepithelial neoplasia (HGPIN) detected on extended core needle biopsy: a UK hospital experience

Version: 2 Date: 13 March 2009

Reviewer: Kenneth Iczkowski

Reviewer's report:

All the recommended revisions have been made except one. The authors did not put in a Kaplan-Meier plot for prostate cancer diagnosis as a function of time from first biopsy.

Discretionary Revisions:
I do not understand the comment that "we feel that depicting [this plot] might be inappropriate for a retrospective study like ours." The Davidson et al. study used this plot and was also a retrospective study.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests'