Reviewer's report

Title: Percutaneous Nephrolithotomy in Horseshoe Kidneys: Is rigid nephroscopy sufficient tool for complete clearance? A case series study

Version: 5 Date: 8 July 2009

Reviewer: Robert J Stein

Reviewer's report:

A very well written and insightful review of experience with PCNL in horseshoe kidneys with a focus on use of rigid nephroscopy for isthmic stones.

I only have 1 Discretionary Revision

These are recommendations for improvement which the author can choose to ignore. For example clarifications, data that would be useful but not essential.

1) Figure 2 is of poor quality and may not be necessary

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests