Reviewer’s report

Title: Prognostic impact of three immunohistochemically detected markers of neuroendocrine differentiation in prostate cancer

Version: 1 Date: 8 May 2008

Reviewer: Roberto Mario Scarpa

Reviewer’s report:

In this manuscript the Authors assess the correlation of 3 markers of neuroendocrine differentiation (chromogranin A, neuron specific enolase and synapthophysin) with stage at presentation and tumor grade in a series of 98 specimen of radical prostatectomy or TURP with diagnosis of prostatic adenocarcinoma.

They conclude that chromogranin A has a better correlation with disease at presentation compared to the other markers. Furthermore they observed that both chromogranin A and NSE correlate with tumor grade.

The Authors must be congratulated for providing new data on this stimulating topic. However, the major conclusion are not novel and the manuscript does not add any significant new information to the current knowledge in this field. Furthermore, the paper includes a relatively small number of patients and has therefore a low statistical power.

Major compulsory revisions:

1) Detailed characteristics of tumors and patients should be provided in a table. 95 specimens from 84 patients (83 in the abstract… clarify the discordance) were included in the study. Therefore 12 patients underwent two surgical procedures. Information about these patients is needed. Did they undergo 2 TURs or a radical prostatectomy followed by a TUR?

2) The Authors classify the patients according to the TNM stage, but most of the specimens are TURP specimens and a correct pathological stage can be assigned only after a radical prostatectomy.

3) In the tables percentages should be used rather than absolute numbers.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests