Ms. Title: GOLPH2 expression in renal cell cancer by Florian R Fritzsche et al.

In this study the Authors analyze the immunohistochemical expression of GOLPH2 protein in a series of renal cell carcinomas (RCC) and report a lack of significant association between GOLPH2 expression levels and several clinicopathological parameters besides histology. Overall the Results suggest that although expression of GOLPH2 tends to decrease in tumour tissues, especially in clear cell RCC, compared to normal tissues, this marker does not appear to have a prognostic or diagnostic value in RCC.

Although reporting negative findings, the study might be of interest for other researchers in the field by highlighting the lack of significance of this protein in RCC unlike to other cancers. However, several flaws need to be taken care of in order to improve it.

Major Compulsory Revisions

Discretionary Revisions

1. The Authors report that 108 patients were enclosed in this study and they report most of the data relative to the entire series. However, they also clearly report that in four of the 108 cases no tumour tissue could be evaluated and, thus, all of the relevant data only refer to 104 patients. It would be much better to only report these 104 patients overall in the study.

2. In the Discussion section the Authors appear to be concerned mainly for the possible prognostic value in non-clear cell RCC, but as they note the number of cases is too limited to draw any conclusion. Thus I would avoid any comparisons with the results obtained in HCC and prostate cancer.

3. I would also eliminate in the Discussion section the speculations regarding the way in which GOLPH2 acts and interacts and the significance of possible splicing variants as well as various glycosilation sites of GOLPH2.

Minor Essential Revisions

Manuscript should be checked throughout for English.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest
Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests