Reviewer’s report

Title: GOLPH2 expression in renal cell cancer

Version: 1 Date: 4 August 2008

Reviewer: Ming Zhou

Reviewer’s report:

This manuscript studied the GOLPH2 expression, by immunohistochemistry, in several subtypes of renal cell carcinoma, and correlated the protein levels to the pathological parameters and clinical outcomes. It is an interesting study, although it is largely a negative study. The manuscript can be improved in following aspects.

1. The authors should clearly define how the immunostain results were graded, i.e., what was considered to be negative, weak, moderate and strong staining.

2. Have the authors also looked at other renal tumours, such as oncocytoma or pelvic urothelial carcinoma? Have they looked at the GOLPH2 expression in sarcomatoid and rhabdoid RCC?

3. The outcome data are bit confusing. Cases with higher GOLPH2 had slightly worse (although not statistically significant) survival. Yet chromophobe and papillary RCCs, which have better survival than clear cell RCC, had higher GOLPH2 expression. The authors may want to try to explain this perplexing result.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests