Reviewer's report

Title: RASSF1A protein expression and correlation with clinicopathological parameters in renal cell carcinoma

Version: 2 Date: 5 August 2008

Reviewer: Alex Sgambato

Reviewer's report:

Minor Revisions

1. In the revised version of the manuscript the Authors have added the following sentence: “This indicates that higher expression of RASSF1A was positively correlated with the higher pT stage, histological grading, and pTNM group stage in the entire study group irrespective to the labeling index”.

What the note: “…..irrespective to the labeling index” means should be clarified.

2. In the revised sentence: “Analysis was carried out for 187 patients with complete follow-up data and pathologically proved clear cell carcinoma of RCC”, I would change the last expression: “clear cell carcinoma of RCC”.

3. It is better to indicate in the text that eighteen patients without primary metastasis developed metastases in the course of follow up, otherwise for the readers will not be clear from where the number 35 in Table 2 for patients M1 comes from since in the text is stated that “Seventeen patients demonstrated metastasis at the time of diagnosis…………….”. and is not specified how many showed metastasis in the course of follow-up.

Discretionary Revisions

1 It might be better to show Figure 2 as percent survival rather than as cumulative Hazard over time.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests