Reviewer's report

Title: RASSF1A protein expression and correlation with clinicopathological parameters in renal cell carcinoma

Version: 1 Date: 9 June 2008

Reviewer: Reinhard Dammann

Reviewer's report:

In the manuscript 'RASSF1A protein expression and correlation...', expression of RASF1A was analyzed in primary clear cell renal carcinomas by immunohistochemistry and Rassf1A expression was correlated with different clinico-pathological parameters.

Major Compulsory Revisions

1. The paper has several flaws. It is unclear if correlations (Table 2) were made for a subset group of tumors with a higher expression of RASSF1A (immunopositivity) or a lower expression (reduced expression) compared to normal tissue.

2. The results are kept to short and a lot of details are missing:
   - How many tumors and normal tissue were actually analysed?
   - Which antibody was utilized?
   - Is this antibody RASSF1A specific?
   - Figures of staining are missing!
   - How was the ,25% labelling index’ established? How many cell were counted? Why 25%? - Moreover it would be helpful to include the ‘Labeling-Index’ of normal cells.
   - Figure 1 is not understandable.
   - Table 2 is incomprehensible: Which correlation (T1..T4, G1…. pTNMI…) were made? What was the ‘labelling index’?

Minor Essential Revisions

Several spelling mistakes.

Level of interest: An article of insufficient interest to warrant publication in a scientific/medical journal

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the
statistics.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests