Reviewer's report

Title: Lemon juice has protective activity in a rat urolithiasis model

Version: 1 Date: 14 June 2007
Reviewer: Palaninathan P Varalakshmi

Reviewer's report:

General
The present study envisages the protective effect of a common herbal treatment, Lemon Juice on the etiology of stone formation. The study is of scientific interest, nevertheless major clarifications are needed before consideration for publication.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)
An important question to be addressed is why didn’t the authors assess the urinary parameters, as that could serve as a major indicator of the effect of lemon juice on stone formation?
It is important to evaluate the level of oxalate that will be formed during EG administration.
Lemon juice is known to be rich in citrate, which is a well-known inhibitor of stone formation. Hence, it is necessary to assess the level of citrate before and after the treatment with lemon juice.

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)
Introduction
Introduction part looks very superficial, it needs to be elaborated with more updated references to further signify the etiology of stone formation.

Results
1. The authors have monitored the changes in the body weight during the pathological conditions. What is the rationale behind the decline in the body weight?
2. Are there any alterations in the kidney weight? Why didn’t the authors assess it?

Discussion
The discussion part contains insufficient information, which needs to be extended to correlate the present data with the available reports.

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)
The quality of the figures should be improved for better resolution.

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interest