Reviewer's report

Title: On the pathogenesis of penile venous leakage: role of the tunica albuginea

Version: 2 Date: 15 March 2007

Reviewer: Richard A Santucci

Reviewer's report:

General

Serious concerns

1. English is poor enough in some areas as to be completely incomprehensible. See line #2, abstract.

2. It is not clear to me that these researchers actually know the work that has been done in this field before. A. Urol Res. 1995;23(4):221-6. Scanning electron microscopy of the tunica albuginea of the corpora cavernosa in normal and impotent subjects. Iacono F, Barra S, Cafiero G, Lotti T.

3. The MS is unpublishable in its current form. Researchers must 1) understand past work in this field 2) relate their hypothesis to past work in this field 3) show how their data does or does not support their hypothesis.

4. Use of unscientific terms and ideas such as "flabbiness" and "flappiness" (sic) makes it unacceptale.

5. I believe most of this EXACT work was done 10 years ago.

Lesser concerns

1. English will require editing.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)