Reviewer's report

Title: Intraprostatic injection of botulinum toxin type- A relieves bladder outlet obstruction and induces prostate apoptosis

Version: 1 Date: 24 December 2005

Reviewer: HC Kuo

Reviewer's report:

General
In this study, the authors investigated the effects of botulinum toxin A on the canine prostate and in men with BPH refractory to medical treatment. They found diffuse apoptosis in dog prostate at 1 and 3 months after Botox treatment. In men the mean prostate volume, IPSS, and QoL index reduced by 18.8%, 73.1% and 61.5%, respectively, and Qmax increased by 72%. They concluded that Botox is a promising alternative treatment for refractory BPH.

Although clinical application of Botox in voiding dysfunction is not new, there are few studies focusing on the effect of BPH. Controversy exists regarding the true effect of Botox on the reduction of prostatic volume and voiding efficiency, however, from the recent clinical reports, Botox might have its role on the BPH that is refractory to 5-ARI therapy. This study adds histological evidence from dog model for the mechanism of therapeutic effect of Botox on BPH.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)
- none

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

- In dog model, the authors used 100 units for prostate injection, the dose was much greater than used in human model (200 units). If we calculated the body weight, the dose used in dogs was about 2 times of the dose used in men (100U for 15Kg in dog/200U for 60 Kg in men). The authors should mention this point in Discussion section.

- Did the authors estimate the prostate volume before Botox injection? Since transrectal sonography of the prostate was used for prostatic injection, how much did the prostate volume reduce after Botox injection. What was the average weight of the prostate in control and Botox groups in dog models? The results should be presented in Result section.

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests