Reviewer's report

Title: Detection of human papillomavirus DNA and p53 codon 72 polymorphism in prostate carcinomas of patients from Argentina

Version: 2 Date: 17 August 2005

Reviewer: Luisa Lina L Villa

Reviewer's report:

General

The revision submitted addresses most of the comments in a very appropriate way. The results are more clearly presented, in accordance with the conclusions drawn. It is still bothering, however, that the authors do not try to specify what the secondary (smaller) band obtained with MY09/11 primers. Even more important, in the absence of a confirmation of the nature of these bands, that is, lack of typing, it is very uncertain to consider HPV-positive the 10 additional samples. I think the authors must consider the possibility of withdrawing the result or at least attenuating the conclusion based on these untyped samples.

---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

page 5: procedure not proceeding, 268bp not 260 for the globin fragment

---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests related to this publication