Reviewer's report

Title: Detection of human papillomavirus DNA and p53 codon 72 polymorphism in prostate carcinomas of patients from Argentina

Version: 1 Date: 27 April 2005

Reviewer: erik wilander

Reviewer's report:

General

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

In this study the occurrence of p53 codon 72 polymorphism has been examined in 41 prostatic adenocarcinomas and in benign hyperplasias. It was observed that p53 polymorphism seemed not to be related to the development of prostatic adenocarcinoma. I have no objections to that part of the study.

In the other part of the study the same material was examined for the presence of onkogenic HPV. It was observed that 5 cases of carcinoma contained high risk HPV type 16. In 12 cases HPV DNA were identified, however in two cases benign HPV types were found and in the rest(10 cases) the HPV type could not be described, due to insufficient material, despite the fact that a PCR method was used for the HPV analyses. I think the authors have to clarify the number of prostatic adenocarcinomas containing high-risk HPV before the study could be considered for publication. It seems quite simple to repeat the analyses that failed.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Reject because scientifically unsound

Level of interest: An article of insufficient interest to warrant publication in a scientific/medical journal

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

i declare that I have no competing interests