Reviewer's report

Title: Primary de novo malignant giant cell tumor of kidney

Version: 2  Date: 7 June 2004

Reviewer: Oluwole Fadare

Reviewer's report:

Overall, the manuscript is now in a shape that deserves publication. The exclusive dichotomy they create - osseous vs non osseous "giant cell tumors" with tumors of different lineages lumped into the latter is one with which I must say I disagree, but opinions might differ among observers

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)
None

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Again, at the bottom of table 1, SCC refers to SQUAMOUS CELL CARCINOMA not SQUAMOUS CALL CARCINOMA. This is a minor correction that was made in the initial review, which instead of addressing, the authors chose to respond sarcastically to.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after discretionary revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No