Reviewer's report

Title: Primary malignant denovo giant cell tumor of kidney

Version: 1 Date: 25 February 2004

Reviewer: Evelyn V. V Gopez

Reviewer's report:

General

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------
Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------
Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

1. 2nd page - line 8 - from we investigated - change to: we report
2. 3rd page - line 19 - correct spelling of the word - nephroureterectomy
3. 4th page - line 1 - omit 'blue'
   line 3 - omit 'shaped or rather'
4. 5th page - line 14 - start a new sentence 'These 'projections/processes' did..'
5. 6th page - last paragraph : after the 2nd sentence, put a period. Then start a new sentence: 'The multinucleated giant cells of the present case showed strongly positive immunoreactivity with CD68, confirming its monohistiocytic origin. CD68 is widely used to identify cell of monohistiocytic origin.

The manuscript is interesting and warrants publication. It is very helpful to know these lesions, esp. in the evaluation of fine needle aspirates of renal masses.

One more correction ; I would prefer my name be published as : Dr. Evelyn Valencerina Gopez

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------
Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests
Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
None