Reviewer's report

Title: Incidental diagnosis of diseases on un-enhanced helical computed tomography performed for ureteric colic

Authors:

Nazim A Ahmad (nazim.ahmed@aku.edu)
Dr M Hammad Ather (hammad.ather@aku.edu)
Jeffrey Rees (jeffrey.rees@aku.edu)

Version: 1 Date: 6 Jan 2003

Reviewer: Tom Meagher

Level of interest: A paper of limited interest

Advice on publication: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the compulsory revisions

Discretionary revisions

. Abstract
- "incidental" should start with capital letter.

The introductory paragraph reads poorly - it might alternatively read `patients presenting to the Emergency Room with flank pain suggestive of acute ureteric colic can have other underlying conditions mimicking ureteric calculi. Early diagnosis and appropriate treatment for other causes of flank pain is important. Many centres are increasingly switching to unenhanced helical CT etc'.

. Background - advantages of UHCT are mentioned - it may be appropriate to mention disadvantages, eg radiation dose.

. Results - 32 patients conservatively managed had inadequate follow up - were these lost to follow up? Clarification would be helpful. The final sentence `others are under close observation by respective specialty expert' is unhelpful and might be omitted.

. Discussion - Suggest omit `however'. The observation of no cases of diverticulitis is significant and should be included in the conclusion.

Compulsory revision
. material and methods (NB should be materials and methods)

. There is no mention of the CT system used. There is no mention of exposure factors (KBP and MAS).

. Table 1 Legend title should read `alternative diagnoses to ureteric colic made by UHCT'.

. Table 2 Legend `incidence of other conditions in previously published series'.

. Illustrations - Arrowheads on both illustrations were poorly drawn and should be replaced by formal stenciled arrowheads. The date of birth is visible on figure 1 and should be removed.
Competing interests:

None declared.