Reviewer's report

Title: The effectiveness of reducing the daily dose of finasteride in men with benign prostatic hyperplasia

Authors:

Michael J Sullivan MD, FACP (drsullivan@ijm.net)
Jack Geller MD, MACP (geller@san.rr.com)

Version: 1 Date: 3 Dec 2001

Reviewer: Ada Wolfsen

Level of interest: A paper of considerable general medical or scientific interest

Advice on publication: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the compulsory revisions

Compulsory revisions:

1. Page 2, paragraph 1, line 1, correct the spelling of "alpha". Paragraph 4, line 1 should read: "after one year of therapy with finasteride 5 mg a day," instead of 2.5 mg a day.

2. Table 1: Please label 2 numerical columns "Day 1" and "One Year."

3. Discussion: Please clarify that Gormley's data indicated that men with benign prostatic hyperplasia treated for 12 months with 1 mg finasteride per day had no significant change in total symptom score. Also in this study of 875 men with benign prostatic hyperplasia treated with finasteride for 12 months, serum PSA suppression with 1 mg per day was not significantly different than PSA suppression with 5 mg per day. This adds support to your interpretation of the small increase in PSA observed after one year of finasteride 2.5 mg daily.

4. Since this was not a randomized trial comparing year two treatment of 2.5 mg finasteride daily to the continuation of 5 mg finasteride daily, please include a comment and any data available on how much change in PSA would be expected if the 5 mg finasteride daily dose had been continued during the second year. Would you expect serum PSA to be the same at 24 months of therapy with 5 mg per day of finasteride as the 12 month PSA value?

Competing interests:
Compulsory revisions:

1. Page 2, paragraph 1, line 1, correct the spelling of "alpha". Paragraph 4, line 1 should read: "after one year of therapy with finasteride 5 mg a day," instead of 2.5 mg a day.

2. Table 1: Please label 2 numerical columns "Day 1" and "One Year."

3. Discussion: Please clarify that Gormley's data indicated that men with benign prostatic hyperplasia treated for 12 months with 1 mg finasteride per day had no significant change in total symptom score. Also in this study of 875 men with benign prostatic hyperplasia treated with finasteride for 12 months, serum PSA suppression with 1 mg per day was not significantly different than PSA suppression with 5 mg per day. This adds support to your interpretation of the small increase in PSA observed after one year of finasteride 2.5 mg daily.

4. Since this was not a randomized trial comparing year two treatment of 2.5 mg finasteride daily to the continuation of 5 mg finasteride daily, please include a comment and any data available on how much change in PSA would be expected if the 5 mg finasteride daily dose had been continued during the second year. Would you expect serum PSA to be the same at 24 months of therapy with 5 mg per day of finasteride as the 12 month PSA value?