Reviewer’s report

Title: Severe renal bleeding caused by a ruptured renal sheath: Case report of a rare complication of percutaneous nephrolithotomy.

Authors:

Murat Y Ugras (mugras35@yahoo.com)
Ali Gunes (gunesali@yahoo.com)
Can Y Baydinc (cbaydinc@inonu.edu.tr)

Version: 2 Date: 29 Jun 2002

Reviewer: Dr Endre Holman

Level of interest: A paper whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Advice on publication: Accept after discretionary revisions

discretionary revisions:

Abstract - Background
5th line: "...relevant morbidity and mortality..." PNL has minimal mortality, this sentence is not correct on this way, mortality should be cancelled.
6th line: equipment does not cause injury, it is caused by the surgeon. "...equipment" should be cancelled.
Abstrcat - conclusion:
"...percutaneous nephrolithotomy may cause some unexpected complications." The procedure does not cause complications, the sentence would be more correct on this way: unexpected complications may arise during percutaneous nephrolithotomy.

Background:
2nd line: "...routine clinical use in 1976..." Fernstrom's publication reported 3 cases only. The routine clinical use has been considered from Alken's publication in 1981: Alken P, Hutschenreiter G, Gunther R, Marberger M: Percutaneous stone manipulation. J Urol 1981; 125: 463. The date and the reference number 1 should be changed, or this reference should be added.
7th line: To my knowledge arteriovenous fistula and pseudoaneurysm are created by the nephrostomy track formation, these should not be mentioned as anatomic anomalies.
14th line: PTFE: the abbreviation should be explained.
Question: was the Amplatz sheath resterilized? If it was how and how many times?

Conclusion:
1st line: PNL is a minimally invasive surgical procedure. (Not "...known to be"...).
The procedure does not cause severe bleeding, the sentence would be more correct like this: ...severe bleeding requireing transfusion may arise during PNL.

My impression is that in this case of haemorrhage the fault may lie with the surgeon, some rough movement might have happened when the sheath teared, unless the material of the sheath has
weakened (that is, why I was asking about the sterilization). Authors should mention in the conclusion that fine movements are necessary during the operation to prevent such complications, proper surgical technique minimizes this risk.

Figures:
X-ray pictures are not necessary, torned Amplatz sheath with the stone (Fig. 3.) is sufficient.

**Competing interests:**

None declared.