Reviewer’s report

Title: PRIMARY RENAL CARCINOID: LOST TO FOLLOW-UP FOR TEN YEARS

Authors:

Ali GUNES (gunesali@yahoo.com)
Ugur YILMAZ (uyilmaz@inonu.edu.tr)
Murat UGRAS (mugras@inonu.edu.tr)
Bulent MIZRAK (bmizrak@inonu.edu.tr)

Version: 2 Date: 5 Nov 2001

Reviewer: Dr T Masuda

Level of interest: A paper of considerable general medical or scientific interest

Advice on publication: Accept after revision, which I do not need to see

This case report describes a rare history of natural course of renal carcinoid, because the patient refused a radical operation ten years ago. Renal carcinoid is a rare disease and mean follow-up period of the disease is reported to be 31.6 months, therefore, long course of natural history of the tumor is not clear. This case report is valuable for showing natural course of the disease for long period. The differential diagnosis of carcinoid is a neuroendocrine carcinoma, but morphologically it is not difficult. And I, as a pathologist, agree with the authors’ diagnosis, seeing the histological pictures they present.

Major points
I think the most important point of this report is not losing follow-up period of ten years but confirming the natural course of the disease for ten years. Therefore I would suggest that the title is changed to be "primary renal carcinoid. natural history of the disease for ten years: case report.

Minor points
A spelling mistake was found. Using a streptomidin-biotin kit (Dako Chemicals, London): page 3, line 17; streptavidin

Competing interests:
None declared.