Reviewer’s report

Title: Neoadjuvant chemotherapy for primary adenocarcinomas of the urinary bladder: a single site experience

Version: 2
Date: 21 July 2014

Reviewer: Estrella Carballido

Reviewer’s report:

- Major Compulsory Revisions
  o Methods: line 66-67: specify which CT scan was done chest? abdomen? pelvis?
  o Line 79-80: define follow up time
  o Results: Need to add description of toxicities that patients experienced. Can not determine if regimen is “safe: based on limited results reported.
  o Discussion: Line 103- discuss rational of using S-1 in this setting
  o Line 69: please comment on lymph node status-all patients were clinical N0?
  o Line 77: please add if LN dissection was done during surgery.
  o Results: discuss non-hematologic toxicities (grade 1-5). In the discussion part only describes myelosuppression, not enough information to determine if this regimen is safe in this population. (for example: fatigue, infections, delay in surgery, worst surgical outcomes after surgery etc) other topics of interest are bleeding risk, transfusions, etc.
  o Table: add node status to clinical stage
  o Define radiographic response

- Minor Essential Revisions
  o Background: line 51-quote references reporting chemo experience with adenocarcinoma.
  o Background: Line 55-update to NCCN version 2.2014.
  o Methods: Define if pure adenocarcinoma cases were eligible versus any mixed histology with predominant adenocarcinoma patients were included?
  o Line 64-Delete word: And
  o Line 74-75: define what would be considered U versus NU
  o Line 119-120: Missing number of patients with PD?
  o Line 126-important role in the react?- not clear-
  o Line 135: CR patient: patient one?, if so brief response with evidence of recurrence at 3 months when it was re staged?-please explain duration of CR.
- Discretionary Revisions
Line 79: can surgical path stage be added?

Discussion: Line 100-101: Quote-poor prognosis
Discussion: Line 113: comment on S-1 data supporting its use in GI
adenocarcinomas

Discussion: Line 116: Define symptomatic treatment? blood transfusions? Define time
patient needed to recover from cytopenias (described as “soon”).

Discussion: Line 118: mean creatinine #.
Discussion: Line 125: ethnicity-comment on data to support this difference

Discussion: Line 133: may increase the difficult in the separation-Not clear
Discussion: Line 147: neoadjuvant chemotherapy can help the operation: safer operation?
Lower risk of complications?

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests: I declare that I have no competing interests