Reviewer's report

**Title:** Black and White Men Younger than 50 Years of Age Demonstrate Similar Outcomes After Radical Prostatectomy

**Version:** 3  **Date:** 26 September 2014

**Reviewer:** Heinric Williams

**Reviewer's report:**

I applaud the authors with a very insightful manuscript. It was a well thought out proposal with an appropriate background and an honest review and discussion of their data. While the data is not necessary novel, it demonstrates something that we implicitly believe, that is, early diagnosis and treatment of prostate cancer will yield good outcomes. They have tackled a unique patient population, that is, men below 50 years of age. When the average age of diagnosis is in the low 60y, knowing what happens to men below 50 y has implications for when screening should begin. Recently, the AUA changed their recommendation to begin screening from starting at age 40 to now 55 -69y based on the EORTC data. However, while not specifically addressed by this manuscript, it has implications about the age at which screening should begin.

To more appropriately address the findings of this article, the authors are suggesting that while the disease is organ confined, appropriate timing of management may mitigate the apparently more biologically aggressive disease seen in black men. However, when the disease becomes extraprostatic, the biology of the disease in black men dictates their poorer biochemical free survival as shown here and in other studies. Interestingly, despite white men having more advanced disease (more non organ confined and higher extraprostatic extension) at presentation, they appeared to have a better biochemical survival. As the authors honestly pointed out, their sample size of black men with recurrences was low. Nevertheless, I agree with their concluding remarks.

**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

'I declare that I have no competing interests'