Reviewer's report

Title: Renal surgery for kidney cancer in Germany 2005-2006: Length of stay, risk of postoperative complications and in-hospital death

Version: 3 Date: 6 June 2014

Reviewer: Adam Luchey

Reviewer's report:

Abstract

1. The background sentence needs to be re-written as it is worded poorly.
2. What were the reasons for choosing 2005-2006 and how is this pertinent to our current urological practice in 2014?
3. The more important question is the breakdown of open versus partial for T1a, T1b, >T2 tumors.
4. Was 18.4% for both partial and open nephrectomies?
5. Why were there less GI complications with partial nephrectomy?
6. Was there a difference in morality between open/partial or laparoscopic/open?
   a. Too many unanswered or poorly described questions/answers for this to be considered an acceptable abstract.
7. Their conclusions are not supported by what the authors state in the results section.

Introduction

8. A comma is needed after 2012.
9. What was the reference for the newly diagnosed patients with renal cancer and death to renal cancer?
10. Objective, this paper could possibly have more scientific merit if 2005-2006 was compared to 2012-2013.

Methods

11. What were “other types” of nephrectomy?
12. Exclusion criteria needs to be re-written as it is hard to follow.

Results

13. Was there a difference in morality for those that had lymph node or distant metastasis?
   a. Probably worth while to exclude these patients

Discussion
14. The use of a standardized reporting of complications (i.e. Clavien-Dindo) would be helpful and needed.
15. Warm ischemia times would be an added benefit to this study (open/lap).
16. No p-values are listed for Table 2.
17. No p-values are listed for Table 3.
18. No p-values are listed for Table 4.

**Level of interest:** An article of limited interest

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests