Author's response to reviews

**Title:** The Impact of Tumour Size on the Probability of Synchronous Metastasis and Survival in Renal Cell Carcinoma Patients. A Population-Based Study.

**Authors:**

Johann P Ingimarsson (johann.p.ingimarsson@hitchcock.org)
Martin I Sigurdsson (martiningi@gmail.com)
Sverrir Hardarson (sverrirh@landspitali.is)
Vigdis Petursdottir (vigpet@landspitali.is)
Eirikur Jonsson (erikjon@landspitali.is)
Gudmundur V Einarsson (gudmein@landspitali.is)
Tomas Gudbjartsson (tomasgud@landspitali.is)

**Version:** 5  
**Date:** 30 June 2014

**Author's response to reviews:**

Lebanon, New Hampshire

June 29th 2014

Dear Editor

We would like to thank both reviewers for their insightful comments and constructive criticism. Below is a point-to-point response their comments. We have addressed their suggestions and changed the manuscript appropriately. Importantly we have responded to the suggestion of Reviewer 2 to only include pathologically proven RCCs in the study. Therefore we have performed all statistics again and changed the manuscript accordingly. This took some time but has improved the manuscript. We hope the manuscript is now ready for publication in BMC Urology.

Please do not hesitate to contact us if further information is needed.

Respectfully,

On behalf of the authors,

Johann P. Ingimarsson, MD

Reviewer 1

-no mention of followup for those patient who did develop recurrence
Reply: While it was our intention to map out risk factors of synchronous rather than metachronous metastasis, this is indeed a fair criticism. While we did not have as reliable or standardized recoding of metachronous metastasis available, we addressed this by adding a subchapter on DSS in patient of previously organ confined metastasis free RCC.

- need histologic breakdown of patients who recurred

Reply: This is also a valid comment and we have added this information in a table which is referred to in the subchapter

-marginal status of primary tumors from partial nx group need to be discussed specifically was there a higher incidence of recurrence

Reply: It turns out that in this population based, largely historical cohort, partial nephrectomies were infrequent. In fact there was only one case of a partial nephrectomy having subsequently progressed or developed metachronous metastasis. This case had negative margins on pathology. This fact thus limits any conclusion that can be drawn from affects of margin status on recurrence

Reviewer 2

1: this is a well-written manuscript that assesses the incidence of synchronous metastases in RCC
2: the materials/ methods section should simply explain how patients were collected, but the actual patient numbers/ distribution should be summarized in the results section

Reply: We agree and have changed the text accordingly.

3: this analysis also includes "clinically diagnosed RCC"; however, the authors comment that the multivariate analysis did not change if only pathologically proven RCC were included. This study should really only include an analysis of only pathologically proven RCC.

Reply: We agree with the reviewer. Therefore we have re-written the whole text and tables and performed statistics with only pathologically proven RCCs.