Reviewer's report

Title: Use of buccal mucosa grafts for urethral reconstruction in children: a retrospective cohort study

Version: 2 Date: 14 April 2014

Reviewer: Eric Massanyi

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions

None

Minor Essential Revisions

The authors state that graft contracture is thought to be a leading cause of failure or complications. Perhaps size of the grafted BMG would be of interest. I would be interested to know if the BMG grafts used in 2-stage repairs differed significantly in size among those with complications vs. those without.

Discretionary Revisions

In this descriptive study, the authors do not offer any other alternatives to BMG for complex hypospadias or stricture disease. Perhaps some discussion of various other techniques (i.e. use of autologous skin grafts, tissue expanders, etc.) would help readers understand that while a 1-stage BMG may have poor outcomes at their center, alternatives exist. It would be nice to know how results compare among the other patients who were "screened out" because BMG was not used.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare I have no competing interests.