Reviewer's report

Title: Inferior vena cava prosthetic replacement in a patient with horseshoe kidney and metastatic testicular tumor: technical considerations and review of the literature

Version: 2 Date: 18 February 2014

Reviewer: Thomas Schwaab

Reviewer's report:

This is an interesting case report on a surgically challenging clinical situation. However, a number of major issues need to be addressed:

1: the background should include updated references on the incidence of this disease (i.e. www.cancer.org)
2: was the pathology on the testicle pure teratoma?
3: were the tumor markers mentioned obtained prior to the orchiectomy? what were the markers after orchiectomy?
4: why was the chemotherapy regimen changed after the first cycle?
5: what was the response of all lesions after chemotherapy? what were the characteristics of the caval mass? (cystic? solid?)
6: since this is mostly a surgical case report, the surgical procedure should be more detailed and supported with intraoperative images and possibly video sections.
7: the imaging is not very representative of the surgical complexity
8: what was the pathology of the caval mass?
9: was all retroperitoneal disease removed?
10: the Discussion is significantly too long: this is a simple case report and now a literature review.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.