Reviewer’s report

Title: Key considerations for the experimental training and evaluation of cancer odour detection dogs: lessons learnt from a double-blind, controlled trial

Version: 1 Date: 3 November 2013

Reviewer: Marcello Siniscalchi

Reviewer’s report:

The study is well conducted and the statistical analyses are sound. Taking together the hypotheses and the results, I believe that the manuscript is almost ready for publication. However, I have noted down a few observations and suggestions that might still help to improve the paper.

Minor comments:

Figures 1 is not very clear and needs graphical improvement

Discussion

Page 12, line 4: It would be useful in informing the design of future studies to verify how many odours a dog can remember and for how long.”

In a recent study on dog’s olfaction it has been shown that when a particular odour is stored in the long-term memory dogs shift their sniffing behavior from the right to the left nostril: this could be extremely useful for “the design of future studies”.

Please add and discuss the following paper:


Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.