Reviewer's report

Title: Hem-O-Lok clip: a neglected cause of severe bladder neck contracture and consequent urinary incontinence after robot-assisted laparoscopic radical prostatectomy.

Version: 1 Date: 26 September 2013

Reviewer: Souhil Lebdai

Reviewer's report:

This is an interesting and well written case report with interesting iconography. However a few points have to be discussed.

1-Was the clip in contact with the sphincter? You said that the clip was strongly attached to the area between the vesico-urethral anastomosis and the urethral sphincter.

2-Since the clip was first removed and then the stricture resected: don’t you think that the incontinence may be the consequence of a too large resection of the stricture or an accidental injure of the sphincter? In other words could it have been avoided or was it technically impossible to spare the sphincter? This should be mentioned in the discussion.

3-You should describe the uretroscopy sphincter aspect before and after the procedure: did it seem functional before the clip ablation or after the clip removal before you started the resection?

4-Could the one month continence be the consequence of an early stricture? Did the flow decrease a that time?

5-Do you have any urodynamic data one month after radical prostatectomy in order to confront it with the post-operative data?

6-About the case presentation section: this section should present the case, as well as a discussion with references to the literature. You should remove the discussion from the conclusion and put it in this section.

7-You did not give any precise data about clip migration in the literature. Do you have an idea of its incidence? How long was usually the interval after prostatectomy? The clips that were not expelled: were they removed? Are continence data provided?


Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely
related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

No competing interests