Reviewer's report

Title: Chromophobe renal cell carcinoma with concomitant sarcomatoid transformation and osseous metaplasia: a case report

Version: 3 Date: 2 November 2013

Reviewer: Kenneth Iczkowski

Reviewer's report:

This is a well-written, well-illustrated, and appropriately brief case report of the first chromophobe renal cell carcinoma with both osseous metaplasia and sarcomatoid transformation. It is only the fifth report of osseous metaplasia. It gives 12-month follow-up on the patient, which is good.

The authors are requested to make just a few minor revisions.

1. In both the abstract and the "Case presentation" on page 4, it is stated that the patient presented with chief complaint of a left renal tumor, but then the CT scan showed a tumor in the upper pole of the right kidney. Please clarify or correct this.

2. on page 5 two-thirds of the way down the page sarcomatoid carcinoma may due--> may be due....

3. On page 3, it's stated that 5-and 10-year survival for CRCC is 100% and 90%. Can the authors give the 5-year and 10-year figures for CRCC with sarcomatoid differentiation?

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests