Reviewer's report

Title: Prognostic benefit of surgical management in patients with renal cell carcinoma extending to renal vein and inferior vena cava: 17-year experience at a single center

Version: 1 Date: 30 July 2013

Reviewer: Gaetano Ciancio

Reviewer's report:

The study is interesting and reports outcome of one of the most complex surgical procedure in urology
Could the authors describe “multiple organ metastases” for RCC in renal vein, I, II, III and IV groups?
Could the authors report the cause of death of the non-surgical group? What type of morbidity did the non-surgical group have? Could any be prevented by surgery?
Why the authors consider multiorgan metastases a contraindication for surgery?
Figure 2 needs to be fixed
In reality the authors have few patients to make any conclusions. Level III and IV are the type of RRC that can have more impact for outcome in comparison of RV, level I and II, therefore they have only 10 patients in the surgical group and 7 in the non-surgical group.

Did the authors note differences in blood loss, transfusions, and surgical techniques depending of the level of the tumor thrombus?

Given that the patient outcome data in this study are pretty limited, in order for this report to add meaningfully to the literature, I think there should be a much more detailed literature review and comparison of outcomes.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.