Reviewer’s report

Title: Hereditary papillary renal cell carcinoma primarily diagnosed in a cervical lymph node: a case report of a 30-year-old woman with multiple metastases

Version: 1 Date: 2 November 2012

Reviewer: carole sourbier

Reviewer’s report:

The manuscript entitled “Hereditary papillary renal cell carcinoma primarily diagnosed in a cervical lymph node: a case report of a 30-year-old woman with multiple metastases” report an HLRCC case lacking leiomyomatosis and with cervical lymph node metastases.

This is an interesting phenotype that physicians treating young patients with kidney tumors should be aware of, especially while treating female patients. However a few concerns need to be addressed prior to publication.

- Major Compulsory Revisions

1. Although this patient is most likely an HLRCC case, no evidences have been provided proving that her disease is hereditary (germline mutation of other family members). Since FH mutations have also been found in a few sporadic papillary type 2 tumors (J Med Genet 2011;48:226-234 ), the authors need to discuss it.

2. The sentence “The intracellular hypoxia inducible factor (HIF) increases due to mutations in this gene region” is confusing. HIF is stabilized due to an accumulation of fumarate that competes with #-ketoglutarate for the binding to the prolylyhydroxylases (for ref: Cancer Cell. 2005 Aug;8(2):143-53.).

- Minor Essential Revisions

1. There are several typos throughout the text.
2. Figure legends should be more detailed (especially for Figures 3 and 4).

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I have no competing interests