Reviewer's report

Title: Genetic Variation in SPAG16 Regions Encoding the WD40 Repeats is not Associated with Reduced Sperm Motility and Axonemal Defects in a Population of Infertile Males

Version: 2 Date: 19 June 2012

Reviewer: Alex Varghese

Reviewer's report:

The study by the authors on analysis of the SPAG16 regions encoding the conserved WD repeats revealing no evidence for association of mutations or genetic variation with sperm motility and ultrastructural sperm characteristics in a cohort of Italian infertile males.

In the introduction - "Infertility impacts approximately 15% of couples [1]" need to be changed based on the current and following reference

Estimates on the prevalence of infertility from 25 population surveys sampling 172,413 women. The 12-month prevalence rate ranged from 3.5% to 16.7% in more developed nations and from 6.9% to 9.3% in less-developed nations, with an estimated overall median prevalence of 9%.


Overall, the manuscript is well written and has clinical importance to be considered for BMC Urology

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interest