Reviewer's report

Title: Effectiveness of Intravenous lidocaine versus Intravenous morphine for patients with Renal Colic in the Emergency Department

Version: 3 Date: 10 March 2012

Reviewer: luca cindolo

Reviewer's report:

1) please cite the website where the trial is registered
2) please cite the sample size calculation and the randomization technique used (the citation of the web site randomization.com is largely insufficient)
3) please specify how the colic pain is diagnosed (personally I think that the criteria of the hematuria is totally arbitrary)
4) please explain how subjects suffering from an acute colic pain could give their informed consent to a clinical trial that uses a potentially lethal drug; please explain also if in your country you can enroll patients aged less than 18 year without parental consent
5) please remove the graph about sex and age
6) please add a table with demographics characteristics and the p values about the comparisons of the groups
7) please add a table with the results in term of pain reduction, stone spontaneous passage, frequency and distribution of side effects
8) please in the abstract correct the description of the 95%CI, more than 95% CI= (60%, 69%), please write "95%CI 0.6-0.69"
9) please edit all the references, some of them are inappropriate and some are uncorrect

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests