Reviewer's report

Title: Stage I seminoma: Treatment outcomes in a low-income country

Version: 3 Date: 2 March 2012

Reviewer: Ahmed Mansour

Reviewer's report:

The authors present their experience with management of stage I seminoma in a tertiary care center in Jordan.

Authors lose track when they concentrate on describing low income and health care policies in Jordan, this has nothing to do with the scope of the article. Patients were treated according to pertinent guidelines during the study period, I assume treatment in a first world country wouldn’t have been different.

Comments:
- Title: Current title isn’t related to the scope of the article at all. Should be changed.
- Objective: Potential predictors of relapse were not evaluated in the article, only 3 patients developed relapse and the numbers don’t allow for performing a sound multivariate analysis of predictors of recurrence. “potential predictors of relapse” should be deleted
- Surgical violation of the scrotum in testicular cancer patients isn’t related to the level of country’s development. Any tertiary care cancer center will receive a fair share of these patients. This theme should be changed in the introduction
- Discussing the nature of the health system in Jordan in the initial two paragraphs of the discussion has nothing to do with the paper. Please change
- Protocol of chemotherapy provided to the patients who developed relapse should be described
- Tumor marker levels prior to orchiectomy should be mentioned, what proportion of patients had high BHCG?
- What percentage of patients had ipsilateral pelvic surgery (inguinal herniorrhaphy, orchiopexy…) prior to radiation? It is known that such procedures alter the lymphatic drainage of the testicle and irradiation of the ipsilateral iliac and inguinal LN including the surgical scar is recommended. Please comment.
- Since the majority of the patients had adjuvant radiation, would be interesting to comment on patients” fertility on long term and whether sperm banking was performed prior to orchiectomy/ radiation.

English and typos:
- “were burdened by relapse” should be changed to “developed relapse” throughout the article
-“Initial treatment almost always includes inguinal orchiectomy” should be changed to “High inguinal orchiectomy is the standard initial treatment”
-“narrated” should be changed to reported
-Typo: “through history” should be “thorough history”
-Typo: “Follow-up was in the form of a patient visit”
-“The length of follow-up ranged from 1 to 200 months…….” should be moved to the results section
-“At the time of follow-up; all but one patient remain alive” should be “were”
-“CT scan of the abdomen in the patient harboring regional recurrence was co-registered with simulation CT scan” should be “CT scan of the abdomen of the patient who developed regional recurrence was compared to the simulation CT scan”
-Don’t include single line paragraphs. Bad writing

**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.