Reviewer’s report

Title: Delayed diagnosis of spontaneous extrusion of a renal calculus in an adult male with spina bifida and paraplegia: case report. Measures to be taken to reduce medical errors in spinal cord injury patients

Authors:

Subramanian Vaidyanathan (vaidyanathansiu@hotmail.com)
Peter L Hughes (Peter.Hughes@mail.soh-tr.nwest.nhs.uk)
Bakul M Soni (Bakul.Soni@mail.soh-tr.nwest.nhs.uk)
Gurpreet Singh (gurpreet.singh@ukgateway.net)
Paul Mansour (Paul.Mansour@mail.soh-tr.nwest.nhs.uk)
Pradipkumar Sett (Pradip.Sett@mail.soh-tr.nwest.nhs.uk)

Version: 8 Date: 17 Dec 2001

Reviewer: Dr Giovanni Gambaro

Level of interest: A paper whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Advice on publication: Accept after discretionary revisions

This is an honest, useful paper. There was probably an over reliance on the US scans, the quality of which is unfortunately clearly radiologist-dependent.

Comp.) It should be discussed whether or not the radiologist did evaluate the loin wall and why he failed the diagnosis. How frequent is misreporting in US scan?

Comp.) Which was the medical flow before referring the patient to the urologist? Clearly the suspicion of the renal trouble was advanced. Thus, the Authors are right in underlying the benefit of discussions of patient's clinical condition between health professionals.

Comp.) Certainly there was a number of reasons (discharging sinus, the beneficial effect of antibiotics) to consider a more severe diagnosis than "pressure mark". Why didn't the Authors perform a CT scan of the spine since they also considered a possible origin of the inflammation from the metal implant in spine?

Comp.) In the general description of the case, did the patient have any fever? Any leukocytosis?

Comp.) The section "What do we learn from this case" does not probably fit with the present medical error. It is more sound to medical and surgical emergency. Thus, it should be deleted.

Discr.) The title should also be modified, i.e. "Unpredicted spontaneous extrusion.....paraplegia: report of a misdiagnosis. Measures ..... reduce urological errors...." since the last suggestions refer only to urological disorders.

Minor: on page 6, 4 line from the top, "...(Figure 3), when this (not his) patient ....".

Competing interests:

None declared.