Author's response to reviews

Title: Laparoscopic versus Open Left Lateral Segmentectomy

Authors:

Kirstin A Carswell (kirstincarswell@hotmail.com)
Filippos Sagias (filippos@doctors.org.uk)
Beth Murgatroyd (beth@londonwls.co.uk)
Mohamed Rela (mohamed.rela@kch.nhs.uk)
Nigel Heaton (nigel.heaton@kch.nhs.uk)
Ameet G Patel (ameet.patel@kch.nhs.uk)

Version: 4 Date: 28 July 2009

Author's response to reviews: see over
Dear Dr. Sabina Alam,

Re: Laparoscopic versus Open Left Lateral Segmentectomy
MS: 1057265705253898

Further to your email received 03/07/09 we have addressed the reviewers’ comments in turn and amended the manuscript accordingly.

Reviewer: Peter Schemmer

a. Methods:
The following sentences/paragraphs belong to the “Results” section and therefore should be replaced:
“Patients presented with either solid lesions, symptomatic liver cysts or liver abscesses, within segments II/III.” and “There were no differences in the patient characteristics between the two groups (Table 1). Median patient age was 54 years (25 – 72). 50% of patients were men (n=10). The patients had similar American Society of Anaesthesiology (ASA) grading (I:II:III); 1:5:4 in the laparoscopic group and 2:6:2 in the open group. Indication for left lateral segmentectomy was malignant lesions in 50% of cases (n=10).”

We have amended the paper in accordance with the above suggestions – see amendment page 7, lines 5-12.

b. Please provide the cost comparison between the groups. In a DRG-based system, it is always (also retrospectively) possible to have a cost analysis.

As per the editorial committee opinion we have not amended the paper with reference to this comment.

Reviewer: CN Tang

In favour of acceptance without further recommendations.

Editorial concerns

Please include your explanation on why ethical approval was not required in the methods section of your manuscript.

We have included a comment with respect to this in the Methods section, page 4, line 18.

Should any further information be required please do not hesitate to contact me.

Best wishes,

Kirstin Carswell