Reviewer's report

Title: The use of a silicone-coated acrylic vaginal stent in McIndoe vaginoplasty and review of the literature concerning silicone-based vaginal stents.

Version: 3 Date: 28 June 2007

Reviewer: mohammed G ellabban

Reviewer's report:

General

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Silicone use in treatment / prevention of hypertrophic / keloid scars has been well established in the literature. Using it in the face or in the vagina does not change the way silicone would react with the wound healing process.

Drawing evidence-based conclusions in wound healing process would need large numbers of patients and standardisation of the technique / factor used.

In this article this is clearly not the case (two patients & using different thickness skin grafts)...

The only way this article is to be accepted is by writing it in the format of short correspondence or short case reports to show a nice modification by the authors to what is already well established in the field.

To conclude; for the limited scientific interest of this article, I would not accept it for publication unless the format is changed to small case reports with changing the title to mark that clearly..

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being
published

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.