Reviewer's report

Title: The use of a silicone-coated acrylic vaginal stent in Mc Indoe vaginoplasty

Version: 1 Date: 1 April 2007

Reviewer: bekir atik

Reviewer's report:

General

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

The newly-designed acrylic stent will contribute to more successful application of Mc Indoe technique in vaginoplasty. There are a few concerns that should be addressed to make this a stronger manuscript.

1. The technique should be described in more detail. For instance, how do you coat the outer surface of acrylic stent with solid silicone? How do you prevent the stent from prolapsing?
2. Why do you coat the outer surface of acrylic stent with silicone? What are the advantages in doing so? These matters should be emphasized. For instance, is it more comfortable for the patient?
3. There are already inflatable soft silicone stents in the market. What is the advantage of your newly-designed stent? Is it cheaper, or does it help the graft fix strongly on the vaginal tissue?
4. Tercan et al. suggested 'The use of fibrin glue in the McIndoe technique of vaginoplasty.' in 2002. More and more, fibrin glue has been used in Mc Indoe Technique. This situation should be emphasized in text.

What next?: Accept after discretionary revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.