Reviewer's report

Title: The use of a silicone-coated acrylic vaginal stent in Mc Indoe vaginoplasty

Version: 1 Date: 10 January 2007

Reviewer: Mohammed G Ellabban

Reviewer's report:

General

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

The authors are addressing the very difficult field of wound healing and its potential complications of hypertrophic scars and keloids....they present TWO case reports ONLY and draw solid conclusions from them in regards of using silicone gel sheet in preventing wound healing problems !!!!!!
the skin used in these two cases are different (Split skin in one & Full thickness in the other)....and they have added in their protocol many other variables (Like aloe vera oint)which might have affected the healing process in conjunction with the silicone sheering which makes their conclusion even more weak and very speculative rather than based on evidence due to the presence of so many variables affecting the healing process and the small number of their case trials.....
saying this I think their use of silicone sheet with the McIndoe stent is a good idea which if put in the proper scientifically designed study it may give more reliable outcome...
If corrections are made and the patient numbers stays the same, this work should only be considered as a letter to the editor or a small communication rather than a case report.....
-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests