Reviewer's report

Title: Extrathoracic Solitary Fibrous Tumor of soft tissues: clinicopathological findings in nine cases

Version: 3 Date: 10 April 2006

Reviewer: David Hardisson

Reviewer's report:

General
This paper describes a series of nine extrapleural solitary fibrous tumors affecting the soft tissues of the trunk and extremities. Although the occurrence of solitary fibrous tumors at extrathoracic sites has been well-documented in the literature, the paper will be of interest to general readers due to the rarity of the condition. In general, the paper is well-written and concise.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)
None

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Methods:
- In the Abstract, the authors state that follow-up should include abdominal ultrasound but in the text (Methods, last paragraph) follow-up includes “computed tomography of the tumor site”.
- Immunohistochemistry: please, indicate antibody source, clone and dilution for each antibody.

Results:
- Abstract, second line: there is a typographical error in tumors’ size (4.5 to (6)(according to the text, the correct size is 10) cm, mean: 7 cm).
- The expression “R1-resection” should be explained.

Discussion:
- The initial sentence of the Discussion is somewhat misleading. In my opinion, the differential diagnosis of SFT should be discussed after the clinical aspects of the lesions.
- Reference number should be indicated after Vallat-Decouveleare et al and Gold et al.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests