Reviewer's report

Title: TITLE : A Needle In the Liver- A rare cause of recurrent liver abscess

Authors:
Chintamani CHINTAMANI Chintamani (chintamani7@rediffmail.com)
Vinay VINAY Singhal (chintamani@doctor.com)
Parminder PARMINDER Lubhana (chintamani@doctor.com)
Rakesh RAKESH Durkhere (chintamani@doctor.com)
Shabnam SHABNAM Bhandari (chintamani@doctor.com)

Version: 2 Date: 7 Jul 2003
Reviewer: Carlos Manterola

Level of interest: A paper whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Advice on publication: Accept after discretionary revisions

A needle in the liver. A rare cause of recurrent liver abscess.

General
I think is an interesting case report of an infrequent clinical condition. I believe also that authors could be more precise in the description of some clinical details and extend a little the discussion as a review of previous published evidence in the field.

Specific commentaries

1. Title: I think it would be more exactly something like "Liver abscess secondary to a broken needle migration. A case report".

2. Which one of the authors is Consultant and Head Department Surgery? This point is not well defined in the text.

3. Key words. I suggest adding some MeSH terms like "hepatic abscess" and "foreign bodies", "Foreign body migration", "Migration, foreign body".

4. Introduction. Probably an introduction saying something like "... is not unusual to see patients with perforation of gastrointestinal tract due to ingested foreign bodies in clinical practice, but, the development of a secondary liver abscess is a rare condition. Recently a patient with a liver abscess produced secondary to a needle penetration was successfully treated by our group....... There is only one previous published article, of Abel et al. in 1971 ................. (Abel RM. Arch Surg 1971;102:227-28.)."


6. Case report.
   a. Detail liver function. Is unusual that a liver abscess, have normal values of alkaline phosphatase (for example), especially in a recurrent one.
b. It would be interesting to know what 3rd generation cephalosporin was used. I supposed that "metrogyl" is metronidazol.

7. Discussion. It could be more extensive.
   a. Reference 1 is repeated at the end of line 4?
   b. At the end of line 7 say (1-15, 16), should say (1-16).
   c. What is the meaning of USG?
   d. At line 15 say (1-11,14), should say (11,14).
   e. Other sites of secondary abscess caused by foreign body's migration are spleen (especially in cases of left colon perforation).

8. References used are few and older, the more recent one was published in 1995, and between 1995 and 2003 at least 21 related articles had been published in PubMed. I suggest some of them that seem to be useful for this manuscript.


9. Legends to figures. I received 5 images (2 of x-ray abdomen, 1 of liver US, 1 of CT Scan and other of the needle) and in the text only 3 of them have legend. On the other hand, I think that lateral view of x-ray abdomen could be eliminated. What is the meaning of CECT?

Competing interests:

None declared.