Reviewer’s report

Title: Impact of comorbidities on postoperative complications and overall survival in patients undergoing laparoscopy-assisted gastrectomy for gastric cancer

Version: 2
Date: 13 April 2014

Reviewer: Ulrich Friedrich Wellner

Reviewer’s report:

The authors present a large-scale retrospective study that examines the effect of comorbidities on perioperative complications and survival after laparoscopic assisted gastrectomy. Methodology and conclusions are sound.

Major Compulsory Revisions
none

Minor Essential Revisions

The authors present a large series of partial and total gastrectomies with a low complication rate and no mortality. While these are excellent results, the fact that only 15% of procedures were total gastrectomies with D2 LAD as over 80% of patients had only stage I gastric cancer should be clearly stated. The patient cohort under study is representative of east asian but not western countries where more advanced disease is common.

Of note, diabetes mellitus and COPD do not qualify as a risk factors for complications or survival. This should be mentioned as it would not be suspected.

Please explain why to omit adequate lymphadenectomy in selected patients when the extent of lymphadenectomy does NOT affect perioperative outcome but survival. The logical conclusion would be to perform adequate LAD in all patients.

Discretionary Revisions

"ultrasonically activated coagulation shears" might be better called "harmonic scissors"

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests