Reviewer’s report

Title: HNPCC from a surgeon perspective: retrospective study of clinical impact of mismatch repair protein expression analysis in colorectal cancer patients less than 50 years old

Version: 1 Date: 3 March 2013

Reviewer: Morton S Kahlenberg

Reviewer’s report:

The authors report studying the tumors using IHC. Only 3/6 MMR proteins were sampled. PMS1/2 were not assayed. This may result in an underestimate of the true number of MSI patients.

IHC alone (especially using 3/6 MMR proteins) should have lead to a genome based test for HNPCC and the results would have more durable.

The abstract states that Group A tumors were more frequently mucinous and, proximal but this is not supported in the text or table 1.

Can you compare the survival of patients in Group A who were MSI+ versus those that were MSI stable.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests