Reviewer’s report

Title: HNPCC from a surgeon perspective: retrospective study of clinical impact of mismatch repair protein expression analysis in colorectal cancer patients less than 50 years old

Version: 1 Date: 24 February 2013

Reviewer: Craig C Lynch

Reviewer’s report:

Major Compulsory Revisions

1. A useful paper, however it does not appear to have been updated for a number of years. The most recent quoted paper is 2008. The question regarding utility of preoperative immunohistochemistry to facilitate surgical decision making has been addressed very well elsewhere; 2 (at least) papers that need to be quoted and considered when formulating your discussion are:

   Preoperative diagnosis of Lynch syndrome with DNA mismatch repair immunohistochemistry on a diagnostic biopsy. Warrier S et al, DCR 2011 54(12)1480-7


2. The widely accepted terminology for HNPCC is Lynch Syndrome, especially in the patient where a genetic defect has been identified.

3. This is a useful historical series and does demonstrate the worrying increased rate of second cancers in Lynch syndrome patients (37%). I presume none of those had extended resections?

4. The discussion and abstract need to reflect the current literature. i.e. preoperative IHC does improve planning and survival.

Minor Essential Revisions

The paper needs revision by a native English speaker:

"loosed expression," "anamnesis" are terms I am not familiar with

"Cheap" not "chip"

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests