Reviewer's report

Title: Management of renal extraskeletal mesenchymal chondrosarcoma

Version: 6 Date: 21 April 2014

Reviewer: Jens Bedke

Reviewer's report:

The presented case report describes the case of a renal extraosseous mesenchymal chondrosarcoma.

The author state that only 8 cases have been published, but they have not included the report by Buse S, Behnisch W, Kulozik A, Autschbach F, Hohenfellner M. Primary chondrosarcoma of the kidney: case report and review of the literature. Urol Int. 2009;83(1):116-8.

Why did the authors perform a needle biopsy first? If they would have suspected a RCC surgery could have been the primary step, especially as confirmed in a clinical cM0 status. If other than RCC was suspected (like a sarcoma in this case) biopsy can lead to an increased risk of tumor spread.

As needle biopsy confirmed the suspicion of a sarcoma the role of neo-adjuvant therapy should be discussed in front of surgery.

Second: Why did the author not perform a surgical non-touch technique? On the one hand hemicolecctomy was performed (I suppose due to non touch technique), on the other hand the authors write "that the surgeons were forced to evacuate the intratumoral content of about 2500 cc of serosanguinous, viscous and gelatinous liquid". This is definitely not in consent with a non touch technique. Later on in their discussion this aspect of intraoperative tumor spillage is not discussed and especially the potential higher risk of local recurrence (which occurred in this patient).

Follow-up of the patient: It is discussed that this entity has a high risk of recurrence, why was the first CT scan planned at 6 months time and not earlier?

TNM: What is the antomic side of R1 and did this correspond to the side of localrecurrence. The tumor is staged as pT4 as Gerota´s fascia was invaded. To my knowledge extension beyond Gerota´s fascia is pT4. Please clarify.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable
Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

no competing interests