Reviewer's report

Title: Which Criteria should be used to define Type 2 Diabetes Remission after Bariatric Surgery?

Version: 3 Date: 10 February 2013

Reviewer: Dorothee Staiger

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions

Minor Essential Revisions

1. In the last paragraph of methods the authors write: „preoperative features were compared with the 18 month follow-up ones using t test for paired samples and Wilcoxon’s test“. Where are the findings concerning this issue?

2. Second paragraph of methods: the criteria used to define diabetes remission is based on the Hba1c Test. Not mentioned was the process of Hba1c testing. As recommended by the ADA (medical care in Diabetes -2012) the diagnostic test should be performed using a method that is certified by the National Glycohemoglobin Standardization Program (NGSP). This is important in so far as the result depends on the method of measurement.

Discretionary Revisions

3. Methods 2. paragraph: the 2009 consensus statement contains one more criterion than was listed by the authors. Mentioned was “diabetes remission as hemoglobin (Hba1c levels below 6%) and fasting glucose levels less than 5.6 mmol/l". Missing is “at least 1 year after bariatric surgery without hypoglycemic medication”.

The authors choose a period of 18 month follow-up. Other authors examine data from a 23 month follow-up after surgery (D.J. Pournaras at al.). The 2009 consensus group defined a complete and partial remission of at least 1 year's duration in the absence of active pharmacologic or ongoing procedures. The criteria for the chosen follow-up period may be of interest to the reader. It is not known if the 1 year period without treatment is included in these criteria.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a
statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests.