Reviewer's report

Title: Mastectomy for management of breast cancer in Ibadan, Nigeria

Version: 4 Date: 3 August 2013

Reviewer: Stanley Anyanwu

Reviewer's report:

Since this is a retrospective study it will be interesting to find out more details about how many people were involved in data acquisition and storage, and the consistency with which these were done.

Staging investigations were not specified and were these applied to all patients?

Stage of the disease not stated

How many patients were triple negative on immunohistochemistry?

For patients who received chemotherapy, what was the source, how many completed the prescribed courses and what was adherence rates compared to other studies on treatment adherence in Nigerian patients.

Since both CMF, CAF and AC were all used, what dosing schedules were adopted and how was randomization done?

How many patients completed the prescribed hormonal treatment for 2 years?

What exactly was the modified mastectomy? How were axillary nodes and Pectoralis minor handled? Was the treatment the same by all surgeons involved?

How was complete clinical response established? What definition of partial was used and how was tumour size accessed (caliper, mammographic, ultrasonologic or PATHOLOGIC)

We're there simple or 'toilet' mastectomies?

Surgical drains lasted 8-14 days, what were indications for removal? Since post op period averaged 12days, did any patients go home with drains?

Since this was a retrospective study, what level of completeness did all the data variables assessed achieve?

In the background, parts of 1st and 2nd paragraphs are irrelevant

There are many studies on management, survival and complications of treatment including chemotherapy from Nigeria which the authors did not refer to and compare their results

Was BMI done for all patients in the retrospective study?

On conclusion the authors used only UCH Ibadan and as such cannot generalize for Nigeria

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests